

“If the Identity of a soul alone makes the same man, and there be nothing in the nature of matter why the same individual spirit may not be united to different bodies, it will be possible that those men, living in distant ages, and of different tempers, may have been the same man: which way of speaking must be from a very strange use of the word man, applied to an idea out of which body and shape are excluded”(340)

Body Theory

- We are our bodies
- Change quickly and thoroughly
- Self is developed through experience
- Constant *self*

Locke's two cents

- Does not agree with the body theory
- Body is not eternally embodied in man
- “consider itself, the same thinking thing, in different times and place; which it does only by that consciousness which is inseparable from thinking”(341)
- Personal perception make up the self

Continued...

- Self is evaluated as the present
- Consciousness now is what it always has been thus it is personal identity
- Consciousness is in every part of our body
- The self is not material
- “it is impossible to make personal identity to consist in anything but consciousness, or reach any further than that does”(343).

Soul Theory

- Our soul is a thinking thing
- The *self* is not material
- Seperate from the body

Lockes Beleifs on the Soul

- Body and soul are somewhat independent of one another
- Soul lives on
- Soul expereinces things
- *Man* loses memories of past life, not soul

continued...Identity

- Soul is not the self
- Self can change souls
- Identical soul and body
- Locke Does not agree with soul theory

- Must understand ourselves to understand our identity
- Identity is how we are defined our interpreted

Soul Theory Denial

- If it were true we would always inhabit the same person
- Soul can exist in more than one being
- Consciousness can vary so we can inhabit different people
- Consciousness is subject to change

The Consciousness Theory

- Also known as the continuity theory or memory theory
- Consciousness keeps people consistent
- Memory is used as a mechanism to recognize ourselves
- Consciousness moves from body to body

Reid's Criticisms

Personal Identity

Loss of consciousness

Memory

Defining Identity and Person according to Locke

Identity

A. continued existence that is affirmed

This term can only be applied to things that have a continued existence

B. Person

“...an intelligent being, endowed with reason and with consciousness, which last he thinks inseparable from thought.”

The Existence of the Individual

- A person exists while it continues to be an intelligent being
- If, however, the intelligent being continues to exist and the person does not or vice versa the individual cannot exist.

Contesting the Contradiction

- Consciousness and psychological continuity are required for personal identity
- People who lose consciousness of former actions

Personal Identity

- Personal identity is rooted in consciousness
- “As far back as this consciousness can be extended backwards to any past action or thought, so far reaches the identity of that person”
- Consciousness, however, is distinct remembrance

The General

a man be, and at the same time not be, the person that did a particular action...”

A general remembers being a middle aged man but does not remember his childhood flogging experience

He is not the same individual as he was when he was a child.

“the general’s consciousness does not reach so far back as his flogging”

The general is, and at the same time is not, the same person

Consciousness

Horse argument

If someone steals a horse and then returns it, the new horse is only similar to the returned one

Changing consciousness due to the compounding of experiences

“no man is the same person any two moments of his life” if personal identity is only made up of memory and consciousness

Sameness

- Reid disagrees with Lock's assumption that our identity consists merely of memories because memories are "transient and momentary"
- Reid does agree with the idea that we are the same overtime by using memory and consciousness as a result of similarities